

Rasem Badran and the Jordanian House: Vernacular References in the Service of Identity

JUNE P. WILLIAMSON
University of Utah

INTRODUCTION

The Jordanian architect Rasem Badran designed and built a series of villa-type houses in Amman in the 1970's and 80's, that challenged the predominant building practices of design professionals in the city. He has claimed that his architectural work is an "attempt to mediate between the past traditions and present practices for a solution that is not archaic."¹ This paper will consider this claim by examining these residential projects in the light of the search by many architects within the post-colonial world for a distinct Islamic identity. I contend that these projects illustrate the formation of an essentialist cultural identity project, enabled by the emergence of a supportive network of historians and critics in the mid-1970's and propelled by the political struggles between the nations of Israel, Jordan and Palestine.

I wish to discuss this cultural identity project in relation to three themes. The first theme is the issue of vernacular village architecture on the banks of the Jordan River, from which Badran claims to take his inspiration. The second is the urban context in which the villas were built—the city of Amman, which has experienced phenomenal growth in the last 50 years due to the twin forces of urban migration and immigration. Finally, I would like to discuss the formation of a discourse of contemporary Islamic architecture as enabled by historians as well as the influential Aga Khan Awards and the periodical *Mimar*.

JORDAN AT THE CROSSROADS

The country of Jordan displays aspects of "invented tradition" in the sense described by Eric Hobsbawm: "'Invented tradition' is taken to mean a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behavior by repetition; which automatically implies continuity with the past."² And later in the same article, "Israeli and Palestinian nationalism or nation must be novel, whatever the historical continuities of Jews or Middle Eastern Muslims, since the very concept of territorial states of the currently

standard type in the region was barely thought of a century ago, and hardly became a serious prospect before the end of World War I."³ The history of the nation of Jordan as an independent state extends back only 45 years, the monarchy was imported by the British and, since Jordan is currently the only Arab nation that grants citizenship to diaspora Palestinians, more than half of its population consists of refugees.⁴ Therefore, we may conclude with Hobsbawm that the nationalist sentiments of Jordanian citizens must be novel. This novel nationalism may be analyzed as of the "collective individual" variety as described by Liah Greenfeld, in which the elite "represents the nation to the people, rather than representing the people."⁵ Furthermore, in the case of Jordan the criteria of membership is ethnic and this ethnicity is plural, consisting of a confluence of pan-Arabic, Islamic, and Palestinian, in addition to Jordanian sentiments.

This "collective individual" nation-state is administered by a professional class of bureaucrats centralized in Amman. This system serves to undermine and thus replace the formerly predominant tribal power structures that operated under various colonial occupiers as well as to consolidate support for the state and for the structures of "plural ethnicity." As Jordan developed from a largely rural area with a subsistence agricultural economy and as educational levels rose, the new professional class helped to strengthen identification with both the nation and the monarchy.⁶

The nation-state of Jordan seems to occupy a unique position; it is geographically and consequently socio-politically located at the crossroads of various enduring conflicts. I submit that the necessity to maintain domestic stability in the face of powerful external forces exerts significant influence on the cultural sensibilities of the ruling elite who vacillate between Islamic, Pan-Arabic, and more localized allegiances and alliances.

THE VILLA PROJECTS OF BADRAN

Against this socio-political backdrop, I return to a consideration of the architect Rasem Badran. Born in Jerusalem in 1945, the son of a well known traditional Islamic painter, his

upbringing was urban and cultured. He studied architecture in Darmstadt, Germany, fortuitously leaving Jerusalem just prior to the Six Day War in 1967 which resulted in Jordan's loss of the city. His thesis project was a proposal for a reconstruction of the bazaar or *souk* in the old city of Kuwait.' This project explored the development of a megastructural cellular building network as a protective envelope over what remained of the traditional fabric. The images of this project indicate an interest in—and mastery of—then current Western design theory and imagery promoting the concept of organic architecture, applied to a Middle Eastern context. The project, vastly different from the traditionalism of Badran's recent production such as the Aga Khan Award-winning Jami' Masjid (mosque) and Justice Palace complex in Riyadh, reflects a utopian acceptance of technology as a means to remake, and thereby revive, the city.⁸ The thesis project contains the seeds of acritique of a westernization trend in the Gulf States towards *tabula rasa* planning that has resulted in cities of glossy corporate blocks and towers.

He graduated from Darmstadt in 1970 and remained in Germany to work. Some of the projects he contributed to during this period were a "Theater of the Future" designed in collaboration with avant-garde playwrights and composers, the visitor service center for the Munich Olympics, and a low cost housing project in Bonn. The housing commission was won in a large competition; Badran and his colleagues stressed the imperative to explore new prefabrication technologies.⁹ With this background, Badran returned (or immigrated to) Jordan in 1973 in order to study the morphology of Jerusalem. He settled in Amman, and began designing experimental houses for friends and acquaintances among the intellectual wing of the Jordanian elite.

One of these early houses is the Villa Madi of 1974-80. The design of the house is dominated by climatological factors. Walls and openings are placed to direct cooling winds and to control the penetration of direct sunlight. Courtyards are introduced to provide shady outdoor living space and to act as functional dividers between the various parts of the house, which is otherwise daringly open in plan and section. The overall form of the house is conceived as an outgrowth of its suburban hilltop site. The openness of the interior, the introduction of inner courtyards and the tent-like imagery of the exterior allude to a nomadic lifestyle, albeit transformed through an idiom informed by technology.

This house was extremely controversial; the allusions to rural village cultural imagery was explicitly rejected by many as backward and regressive. This was despite the extensive transformation required to render the forms permanent through the use of concrete and limestone. In the context of post-1967 politics and the continued migrations away from rural villages, this was a project that seemed to rehabilitate imagery that was still in the process of undergoing repudiation.

A faith in technology is expressed in the structurally complex concrete required to create the openness of the interior, as well as in the dominant diagonal lines in the plan that impart a potent dynamism to the house. The playful

collection of forms seem equally airborne and rooted to the ground, hovering in a liminal space. This is unlike the use of traditional vernacular imagery and methods of construction advocated by the social traditionalist Hassan Fathy, whose political agenda involved direct exaltation of the poor.¹⁰ Badran, by contrast, sought to inhabit an avant-garde "mediator" position, critically responding to changes in society without rejection of the past.

The Villa Handal of 1975-77 similarly responds to the hot dry climate; it opens out to the north to avoid direct sun and the walls are placed to channel cooling winds. Instead of an organizing courtyard, Badran introduced a main circulation spine that controls degrees of privacy in the house, from the public street and the guest reception hall to the private family living spaces and bedrooms. In commentary about this house, specific reference is made to a cultural requirement that the entry sequence be designed to enhance a sense of privacy, described as an "old Arab principle." The overall image of this villa is more boxy and differentiated than the sleek and dynamic Villa Madi, but similar elements such as diagonals in plan and sloping roofs remain. Prominent in this house are large arched openings onto the courtyards, evocative of the structural arches used to construct rural stone houses. The formal strategy in this villa is additive. Various rooms are grouped around the main circulation spine, which is analogous to a village street. Badran made efforts to simplify the interior spaces into a series of squarish rooms, analogous to village houses. The differentiated, boxy appearance of the exterior seems intended to convey the impression of a micro-cosmic village collected in one house. If the Villa Madi reflects the nomadic *bedouin*, than the Villa Handal suggests the settled *fellahin*.

These houses, and others of this period, are highly inventive and exhibit a skillful manipulation of forms producing exciting and unexpected results. But in a 1987 interview in *Mimar* Badran explained that his work changed in the late 1970's when he began a "serious search into the socio-cultural background."¹² Formerly he had been primarily concerned with the aesthetic consequences of considerations of climate, materials and "the body in space." One can detect an increasing self-consciousness about history and tradition creeping into the work over time, as the designs become *less* inventive and evocative of vernacular village architecture and more directly derived from specific typologies, including the urban villas in Jerusalem and Damascus from the late Ottoman period.

A later villa, the Izz el Deen of 1983, exhibits major differences from the earlier houses.¹³ While the earlier houses express the form relationships between the inside and outside spaces, now the emphasis is distinctly concentrated on the interior. The exterior is treated as a box or shell in which interior spaces are carved out in a stereometric manner. An entry courtyard is used to extend the sequence of arrival into the very center of the house, where a lobby and additional courtyards rigidly divide the house in half, one side for the public reception spaces where guests are received and the

other for the living areas of the house. In addition, the central axis of movement through the house is shifted slightly off axis, much as a mosque is in the urban fabric. The overall impression is of a perfectly respectable town house of elegant proportions and constructed of refined materials. Other similar villas from this period are the **Khorma** and **Marto** residences.

I contend that **Badran's** cultural identity project shifted from a consideration of regional characteristics that could express a critical reading of plural Arab, Palestinian and Jordanian ethnic identities to an essentialist search for a distinct catalog of forms, images, and spatial organizational strategies that might denote an Islamic architectural identity.

THE VILLAGE VERNACULAR

In the nineteenth and early twentieth century most of the people settled along the banks of the Jordan River were either nomadic shepherds, called *bedouin*, or settled agriculturists, called *fellahin*. The dominant political system was tribalism; as described by Suad Amiry, "Clan affiliation was the first and strongest affiliation that a peasant felt. This was certainly stronger than any other affiliation (national, regional, religious etc.) he ever had."¹⁴ As already described, this situation has changed dramatically in the past half century. But it is important to consider **Badran's** search for a contemporary architectural expression in Jordan in the context of tribalism and pastoralism, modes that rendered the substantial population of Palestine and Jordan virtually "invisible" to 19th century explorers and 20th century Zionists.¹⁵

The fellahin villages in Jordan usually consist of at least two clan families living in clustered dwellings; the dividing lines between these clans are often distinctly apparent in the form of the village, through the location of major paths and open spaces. The inhabitants of a single village typically share the same religion, either Muslim or Christian, but these religious affiliations are not adhered to in the traditional formation of alliances between tribes. Approximately ten percent of the population of Jordan is Christian and tribal warfare often involved mixed Muslim-Christian alliances in opposition to one another. Also, the region that is now Jordan was a hotly contested frontier between bedouin and fellahin, due to important trade routes that traversed the region.¹⁶ Yet as the tribal structure is weakened, national politics are increasingly split along religious lines." This seems to support a generalization that religious identity comes more into play as a political force as the boundaries of the public sphere grow larger.

The houses in the villages are constructed of limestone or basalt, depending on local availability. As timber is scarce due to millennia of inhabitation and subsequent deforestation, the most typical structural strategy is to construct a series of large stone arches, laid in parallel, which are then spanned with bamboo and topped with a mud and straw roof. The large communal living space, animal stables or *khans*, cooking stoves, and storage spaces are all clustered around an open

court, sometimes called a *hosh*. Much of the daily activity takes place on the roofs. The village buildings appear like an outgrowth of the rocky earth and are hardly distinguishable in the landscape from afar.¹⁸

The available ethnographic evidence about these villages dates from the late 19th and 20th centuries, but much greater historical claims have been made for this research. The villages have been approached like living archeological sites. In the classic 1930's study "The Palestinian Arab House: its Architecture and Folklore," T. Canaan wrote, "It may be assumed that, in general, the present people of Palestine are housed in a manner not greatly different from the manner usual in ancient times."¹⁹

Urbanized Jordanians still maintain strong ties to their villages of origin, refusing to sell their family lands even though poor squatters may now occupy the old houses. Most of the Palestinians now residing in Jordan also maintain strong romanticizing ties to their home villages in the West Bank and Israel (although approximately 400 of those villages were destroyed in the immediate post-Mandate period of 1948-52).²⁰ Many urban Jordanians visit their villages on the weekends, to escape the congested city and to camp out in nature and engage in recreational farming or hunting. A definite nostalgia has taken root since the early 1970's when **Badran's** controversial early houses were built. Recently proposals have been made to renovate uninhabited villages into touristic resorts and a noted *caravanserai* on the outskirts of Amman has been turned into an immensely successful Ottoman theme restaurant, replete with period crafts and costumes.

Badran refers to the villages as the most appropriate model for his work in Amman, which in his view lacks an urban tradition such as that he grew up with in Jerusalem. He says, "In Amman I missed the comprehensive climate and the rich environment needed to generate [an architectural] identity where the past and the present meet."²¹ But rather than turning to Jerusalem, he focuses on fellahin villages with which most of the residents of Amman have strong personal associations. Why does he not draw from the model of Jerusalem? I suggest that not unlike Canaan quoted above, **Badran** may have sought to find the "true" cultural heritage of the region in the vernacular by extrapolating contemporary examples into historical truths about a way of life. In effect, the village presents a source for inventing a new tradition of urbanism. At the same time that the fellahin and bedouin lifestyles are repudiated through the mass exodus to the capital city, **Badran's** introduction of similar forms into that city in the early houses struck many as an affront with the imagery and customs they were trying to escape. Although not specifically acknowledged in the various published interviews, this seems to have been the intended effect. But this critical agenda was diffused in the early 1980's, perhaps as faith in the necessity to express and attempt to elicit the spiritual dimension of culture, through form, became transcendent. In 1987 **Badran** hoped the Riyadh project would be seen "as a contemporary and intellectual architecture for Muslim communities. It is a master plan for

a way of life, rather than just a visual exercise or a personal expression of man's desires and cultural background."²²

THE DEVELOPMENT OF AMMAN

Amman is located on the ruins of the ancient Roman city of Philadelphia which was built on the site of the Biblical city of Rabbath Ammon. At the turn of the century it was almost uninhabited, except for a small settlement of Circassians who had emigrated from Russia. In 1921 it was chosen over Salt, a much larger town that had been the local seat for the Ottoman governor, to become the capital of the British protectorate of Trans-Jordan. It has grown phenomenally, experiencing notable bursts of immigration after the 1948, 1967, and 1991 wars. Badran's villas are products of the 1974-1982 building boom that followed in the wake of wars with Israel and the destabilization of Lebanon. The boom was fueled by rising incomes and an influx of capital from expatriate workers and oil rich Arab governments.²³ After the Gulf War the population grew by about 25% through the absorption of Palestinians expelled from the Gulf states to a present population of over 1 million, precipitating another huge building boom.

The history of the development of the city has been one of almost unplanned expansion and urban sprawl, not unlike the development of many American sunbelt cities. Much of the architecture, especially in wealthier areas, is highly ornamental and decidedly eclectic—apartment houses sprout antennae shaped like the Eiffel tower, limestone mansions are given neo-classical detailing, a pattern of repeated upside-down pointed arches decorate parapets. The only consistency is the required use of limestone facing. In the poorer areas and Palestinian refugee camps, a jumble of one and two story concrete dwellings with rebar sticking up into the air cover the dusty hillsides.

Ironically, unplanned growth is one of the characteristics of the vernacular village. What is considered unique, picturesque and indicative of an innate sense of organization in the village context, becomes grotesque when expanded to the scale of Amman. Badran comments, "What we see now in modern Amman reflects the chaos and the 'carefree' attitudes which have led to the destruction of aesthetic and moral values of the city."²⁴ By associating Badran's use of the term "carefree" with free market capitalism, we may assume that he is alluding to the critique of the modern metropolis as a site of alienation and loss of community; his fear of moral degradation is expressed in the increasing Islamicization of his rhetoric concerning design. But if the term "carefree" is taken simply to mean a lack of interest in the civic realm, it may be argued that it is these same attitudes (affiliation to family and clan above national, regional or religious interests) that shaped the villages Badran so admires.

Socioeconomic stratification is enforced by the zoning codes. The poor are ghettoized into Palestinian refugee camps where land ownership is denied, overcrowding is severe, and basic services are often not provided because the code stan-

dards are too high to allow decent low cost housing to be developed. The codes demand very wide roads (14 meters), large minimum lot sizes, with maximum coverage of 40%, and set backs on all four sides of from 2.5 to 7 meters, depending on the area classification.²⁵

The set-backs, in particular, complicate the process of building on the steep hillsides of Amman—in most cases substantial excavation is required to achieve the required set-backs. These codes prescribe the autonomous "villa" type of housing that Badran has designed for his wealthy clients. One report states, "It has already been demonstrated that the excessive road widths push the cost of infrastructure and land beyond the reach of all but the upper 20 percent of urban households... Natural neighborhood gathering places such as the landings of staircases and junctions between houses disappear due to the greater amount of land in the neighborhood being devoted to paved streets."²⁶ In his villa designs I would argue that Badran has consistently critiqued the stringent codes (while conforming to them) through the introduction of such communal spaces *within* rather than between the houses.

THE "ISLAMIC" IDENTITY PROJECT

So far I have been discussing Jordan in political and physical terms without much reference to religion. I think it is clear that the vernacular architecture of the region is not determined by religious factors, except perhaps at the level of ornament, such as the inscription of crosses or Koranic over doors in Christian houses. However, most of the literature about the architecture uses the label "Islamic."

In his introduction to *Architecture of the Islamic World*, published in 1978 during the same period as Badran's conceptual shift from the environmental (outside) to the spiritual (inside), Ernst Grube sets forth a number of criteria to define Islamic Architecture. First, is a focus on the inside over the outside, exemplified by the use of courtyards. Second is a lack of correlation between form and function, in other words, the same building type may serve a variety of uses. Third is a lack of compositional balance, directionality, or axuality. Fourth is the reservation of ornament for the interior, and the application of that ornament in a manner that contradicts the tectonics of the architecture.?' These generalities, articulated by Grube in the late 1970's and popularized by *Mimar* and numerous other books at that time, including many published by the Aga Khan Award for Architecture, could be increasingly observed in the buildings of architects who are Muslims, such as Rasem Badran. Badran dates his own increasing awareness of "socio-cultural background" to this same period. The houses from the early 1970's, such as the Villa Madi and the Villa Handal do not meet these criteria of "Islamic" Architecture, while the Villa Izz el Deen of 1983 does in many respects.

It seems that ambitious architects could achieve a certain amount of legitimacy and publicity by adhering to the standards articulated by the critics and historians. To take an overtly Islamic position went beyond aesthetics; it was a

political statement that allowed the co-existence of Islam and the avant-garde of Jordanian society. By explicitly separating modernization and social progress from westernization, public intellectuals put forward an alternative to the pan-Arab socialism of Nasser that had held sway prior to the events of 1967. This alternative wedding of Arab and Islamic identity also offered an antidote to fundamentalist fanaticism which, at least in the eyes of the western world, defined Islam as violent struggle. But at the same time historical accuracy was blurred as the Orientalist language and strategies of the West were coopted and the dichotomy of "otherness" was maintained.²⁸ This situation is clarified by examining arguments regarding urbanism; the Islamicized viewpoint supported resistance to the increasing internationalization of mainstream planning and architectural production.

Badran stresses his belief in the connection between Islam and social democracy: "Islamic morality played a big role in the past by separating the home environment and its owner's social status from the street environment, which belongs to all classes."²⁹ In this statement Badran expresses a desire to promote a shared public sphere, devoid of class markings as well as the maintenance of a separation between inside and outside, privacy and publicity. By drawing inspiration from the complex but comprehensible forms of the vernacular village for his houses in Amman, Badran attempted to explore, through architecture, the issues wrenching the society in which he lived: Jordanian and Palestinian nationalisms, Arab identity and the cultural forces of Islam.

This Islamic identity project must be examined against other identity projects based upon the same historical and ethnographic evidence. A conflation of identity projects may even be observed within the architectural production of Badran, who moved from a search for a plural Jordanian-Palestinian/Arabic architectural expression, based on transformations of the vernacular village, to the search for a more generalized Islamic identity. By comparison, a similar project was undertaken in Mandate-era Palestine and early Israel, supported particularly by Erich Mendelsohn who sought a genuine combined Jewish-Arab/ Semitic architecture. Perhaps deriving legitimacy from ethnographic studies such as Canaan's (cited earlier), Mendelsohn wrote, "the life of the [Arabs] in many regions is today little different from what it was during the time of Abraham."³⁰ Thus Mendelsohn and Badran may be understood use similar means to different ends. In support of Badran's process of "inventing tradition," the historian Udo Kultermann wrote in the pages of *Mimar*, "The historic roots of contemporary architecture in Jordan can be traced back to earliest settlement in the region, when Jordan was the homeland of the Samaritans, the Israelites and the Palestinians.""

CONCLUSION

Badran's recent activity has extended beyond the borders of Jordan to sites in Iraq, the Sudan, and Saudi Arabia and has increasingly involved large public commissions won through

competitions. The issue of Islamic identity is more directly evoked in these works which involve governmental and religious programs. In this work Badran increasingly pursues an explicit appeal to the values of Islam to provide cultural and moral continuity.³² Examining the early domestic projects of Badran sheds light on his development from an architect with faith in technology and a willingness to respond to cultural and physical environmental contexts in Jordan to a designer with a cultural agenda to revive Islamic identity in architecture. The character of the "mediating" role he chose to play became increasingly directed towards the process of utilizing history for an essentialist end. In light of the socio-political situation in Jordan and the complex nationalism harbored there, this viewpoint is comprehensible and yet it must itself be historically examined as a product of a constructed instrumentalist mode of discourse that remains increasingly prevalent.

NOTES

- ¹ Rasem Badran, lecture at MIT (November 10, 1992). Videotape in the Rotch Visual Collection at MIT.
- ² Eric Hobsbawm, "Introduction: Inventing Traditions", in Eric Hobsbawm and Terrance Ranger, eds., *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), p. 1. See also *Nations and Nationalism Since 1970* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- ³ *Ibid.*, pp. 13-14.
- ⁴ William L. Cleveland, *A History of the Modern Middle East* (Boulder: Westview Press, 1994).
- ⁵ Liah Greenfeld, "The Modern Religion?" *Critical Review* 10, no. 2 (Spring 1996) pp. 181-185. See also Greenfeld, *Nationalism: Five Roads to Modernity* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992).
- ⁶ Peter Gubser, *Politics and Change in Al-Karak, Jordan* (Boulder and London: Westview Press, 1985).
- ⁷ Published in *L'Architecture d'Aujourd'hui* (December 1973), p. XXV.
- ⁸ The Riyadh project is published in Cynthia Davidson, ed., *Architecture Beyond Architecture* (London: Academy Editions, 1995). The design process is discussed in Raseen [sic] Badran, "Historical References and Contemporary Design," in *Theories and Principles of Design in the Architecture of Islamic Societies* (Cambridge, MA: The Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture, 1988), pp. 149-159.
- ⁹ Akram Abu Hamdan, "Rasem Badran," *Mimar* 25 (September 1987), pp. 50-70.
- ¹⁰ See Hassan Fathy, *Architecture for the Poor* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1973).
- ¹¹ Udo Kultermann, "Contemporary Architecture in Jordan," *Mimar* 39 (June 1991), p. 13.
- ¹² Hamdan.
- ¹³ The images of the Izz el Deen house are mislabeled as the Marto residence in *Mimar* 25.
- ¹⁴ Suad Amiry, *Palestinian Rural Settlement and Architecture* (London: Friends House, 1983).
- ¹⁵ For an eloquent though polemical description of this condition see Edward W. Said, *The Question of Palestine* (New York: Vintage Books Edition, 1992).
- ¹⁶ Farouk Abdul-Khaleq Yagmour, *The Relationship Between Historical Growth and Planned Development Growth of the Balqa-Amman Region of Jordan* (State University of New York at Buffalo, Ph.D. dissertation, 1981).

-
- ¹⁷ Gubser.
- ¹⁸ These generalizations stem from research done with Professors Kamel Mahadin and Ihsan Fahti of the University of Jordan in the summer of 1992 under the auspices of the Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture at MIT. Supporting information was found in Ammar Khammash, *Notes on Village Architecture in Jordan* (Lafayette: University of Southwestern Louisiana, 1986). For an early description of this construction method see T. Canaan, "The Palestinian Arab House: its Architecture and Folklore," *Journal of the Palestine Oriental Society*, XII (1932); XIII (1933).
- ¹⁹ T. Canaan, "The Palestinian Arab House: its Architecture and Folklore," *Journal of the Palestine Oriental Society*, XII (1932), p. 225.
- ²⁰ Amiry, p. 8.
- ²¹ Hamdan, p. 61.
- ²² Hamdan, p. 67.
- ²³ Dr. Hans H. Lembke, et. al., *Energy Use in Residential Buildings in Greater Amman* (Berlin & Amman: German Development Institute & Royal Scientific Society, 1985).
- ²⁴ Hamdan, p. 55.
- ²⁵ Ernest Slingsby, et. al., *Urban Design Chapter* (Amman: Urban Regional Planning Group, 1979).
- ²⁶ Slingsby.
- ²⁷ George Michell, ed., *Architecture of the Islamic World* (New York: William Morrow & Co. Inc., 1978).
- ²⁸ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books Edition, 1979).
- ²⁹ Hamdan, pp. 66-67.
- ³⁰ Erich Mendelsohn, forward to Gershon Canaan, *Rebuilding the Land of Israel* (New York: Architectural Book Publishing Co., 1954), p. 3.
- ³¹ Kultermann, p. 10.
- ³² Badran, lecture at MIT.